S-38.042 Seminar on Networking Business 2004
Network Identity, Kai Kang
Opponent's comments by Lasse Rautopuro

Relevance

Network identity is an important topic to discuss in all kinds of networks, mobile networks especially. While the topic is relevant and has been well addressed in the paper, the link to regulations is missing. The drivers for network identity are described, but any restrictions either from legislation or organizations, which seem to be a key issue in the seminar, have not been presented.

Form

Both the paper and slides are well presented, starting from an introduction and definition and proceeding to examples about different types of network identification. The paper has some spelling errors and missing headlines (1.1?), but the overall form is well defined.

Substance

The introduction to network identity along with the examples gives the reader a good basic understanding about the topic. However, I didn't find the example about Liberty Alliance to be very clear – an example about users and transactions would have been a good addition. There is also a separation between an active network identity (say a host name) and business transaction or "log on" identities and I would have liked to see a few more words about the subject.

Concerning the theme of the seminar, there should be more information on regulations, at least on a basic level. Otherwise the presentation gives good insight into the subject.