

S-38.042 Seminar on Networking Business, Fall 2004

Antti Pihlajamäki's comments to Markku Kilpinen's paper presented on 20.10.2004

Unused Licensed Spectrum

Relevance

The relevance of spectrum licensing is great from both the business and regulatory point of view. In that since the topic of the paper is very relevant in this seminar concentrating on networking business and regulation.

The paper presents spectrum license regulation in Europe and in USA. The two different approaches used by these regions are presented. Finland is used as an example of spectrum licensing and the different economic affects are studied. The relevance of the paper in general is quite good although the case study would have been nice to see in the paper too.

Form

The structure and from of the paper are not quite what I anticipated based on the papers presented earlier in this seminar. The overall structure is fractioned and the paper is not very easy to read. The paper consists of a very large number of small paragraphs which makes the reading hard. The several wireless technologies named in the paper are presented just as acronyms. It would have been nice to explain briefly the most important ones and spell out the acronyms. There certainly would have been space for that since the paper is only four pages long.

The reference list is quite short containing only five sources of information. It's also quite impossible to check the references because of the inadequate information given about the references. A link and referencing date would have been nice for the web-resources. The tables presented in the paper are good but not referenced in any way in the text.

Substance

The paper contains a lot of good information and conclusions but some background study is still needed by the reader to fully understand the content of the paper. Especially the third chapter about the differences in different WCDMA technologies and implications is very informative. Chapter three includes also two tables and I would have appreciated some explanations on especially the frequency allocation scenarios presented. In over all the paper contains plenty of relevant and good information but fails to concentrate on anything properly and thus leaving the reader with a vague picture of spectrum allocation and the many wireless technologies mentioned. Maybe if the scope of the paper would have been a bit narrower it would have been possible to make the paper more thorough.