

S-38.042 Seminar on Networking Business, Fall 2004

Mikko Heikkinen's comments to Miikka Poikselkä's paper presented on 3.11.2004

Emergency call positioning

Relevance

Emergency call positioning is an example of regulator driven new technology implementation and thus relevant for this seminar handling regulatory issues in networking business. The most relevant issues concerning the topic were at least mentioned in the paper. It described the issue from both American and European perspectives which are the most relevant ones.

Form

The overall structure of the paper was logical and clear. However, there are some style issues present in the paper: the paper is written with a 12p font instead of the 10p requested, references are not in a numerical order, there are apparently web links missing from the references making checking them complicated, the text is not justified decreasing the readability of the paper, and author's affiliation information is only partial. In addition, the paper contains several long direct quotations which could have been integrated as part of the text making it more flowing. Furthermore, the readability of the text could have benefited a lot from an additional round of proofreading as there were several grammatical and spelling errors still present in the text – none of them critical, though. With these moderate improvements the form of the paper would reach, in my opinion, a very good level.

Substance

The paper contains a lot of good information presented in a logical way. All the issues requested were handled in the paper. I especially enjoyed the technical solution description part concerning circuit switched mobile networks where the author has done a good job presenting the major principles behind emergency call positioning. Also the regulatory part contained the essential information. However, there could have been some technical and cost analyses concerning how the positioning accuracy requirements can be met.

The value network and cost recovery issues were presented quite superficially. Further discussion about these issues would have been a valuable improvement to the substance of the paper. It would have been interesting to see some order of magnitude cost estimations as there would have been room for this discussion taking into account that the paper was written with a large font.

The author's own solution for packet switched mobile network left me with mixed feelings. I don't have enough expertise to analyse the validity of the solution. It would have been more relevant to present initial drafts of the 3GPP Release 7 if they were available but they apparently were not. Also, the text concerning positioning in a packet switched mobile network was not presented as clearly as the circuit switched mobile network part and could have benefited from rephrasing. The animation on the presentation slides clarified it slightly, though. Even so, the author has made a respectable effort creating his own solution for the issue.